

Exhibit C

Submitted 6/17/19

If you have any questions completing this form, please contact Angela Jacobs at (202) 366-0076. Please complete all applicable information and attach this request via email to angela.jacobs@dot.gov or via U.S. mail to:

**Tolling and Pricing Team,
Federal Highway Administration
Office of Operations, Attn: Angela Jacobs,
1200 New Jersey Avenue, SE, Room E-86 204,
Washington, DC, 20590**

Please copy your respective FHWA State Division Office

A) What is the requesting agency, authority, or public company? What is the lead office within the requesting agency, authority, or private company?

Name(s): New York State through the New York State Department of Transportation (NYSDOT), the Triborough Bridge and Tunnel Authority (TBTA), an affiliate of the Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA), and the New York City Department of Transportation (NYC DOT).

Project Website (if applicable) or Your Agency/Company Website:

<https://www.dot.ny.gov>

<https://new.mta.info/>

<https://www1.nyc.gov/dot>

B) Contact Information

Name: Ron Epstein

Title: Executive Deputy Commissioner, New York State Department of Transportation

Address: 50 Wolf Road, 6th Floor, Albany, NY 12232

Phone: (518) 457-8362

Email: ron.epstein@dot.ny.gov

Name: Allison L. C. de Cerreño, Ph.D.

Title: Sr. V.P., Business Operations & Transformation Officer, Triborough Bridge and Tunnel Authority

Address: 2 Broadway, New York, New York 10004

Phone: (646) 252-7750

E-mail: acdecerreno@mtabt.org

Name: William Carry

Title: Senior Director for Special Projects, New York City Department of Transportation

Address: 55 Water Street, 9th Floor, New York, NY 10041

Phone: 212-839-6657

Email: wcarry@dot.nyc.gov

C) What is the requesting agency seeking? (Please mark appropriate box)

☒ **Federal Tolling Authority ONLY** for this project or study (no funds requested).

Please briefly elaborate: New York State, through NYSDOT, TBTA and NYC DOT, is seeking federal approval under the Value Pricing Pilot Program (VPPP) to initiate a variable tolling program within the Manhattan Central Business District (CBD), generally defined as the area of Manhattan south and inclusive of 60th Street. The purpose of this variable price tolling program is to reduce the high level of traffic congestion in the CBD. The applicants believe that a variable toll to access the CBD, combined with an investment of the

Submitted 6/17/19

resultant revenues in improving public transit alternatives, will maximize the congestion reduction in the CBD and the surrounding area.

D) Please provide a brief description of the project/corridor seeking tolling authority. Please identify and describe the subject facility or general area where a toll is to be applied (i.e. name of project/study, location, length, level of service, problem to be addressed, etc.

1). Project History:

The New York City metropolitan region is a vital part of the national economy, accounting for nearly 10% of U.S. gross domestic product. At the center of this region is New York City, home to 8.6 million residents and 4.4 million jobs. Since 2010, the City has undergone tremendous growth and added 440,000 residents, equivalent to the population of Miami, and 700,000 jobs, equivalent to total employment in Philadelphia. New York City is also now the most visited city in the United States, with an estimated 65 million visitors in 2018. Within New York City, the most economically important area is the Manhattan CBD (the area south of and inclusive of 60th Street). This area of just nine square miles boasts over two million jobs, 450 million square feet of office space, and 600,000 residents. See Attachment A for a description of the Manhattan CBD.

However, the continued economic vibrancy of the City and region is threatened by rising traffic congestion. With robust growth have come additional demands on the City's transportation infrastructure, with an increasing number of cars, buses, delivery trucks, taxis and for-hire vehicles competing for scarce roadway capacity. Congestion in New York City ranks fourth worst among cities in the United States (*Global Traffic Scorecard*, INRYX, 2018), with the average auto commuter spending an additional 133 hours on the road each year due to traffic. As shown in Attachment B, traffic speeds in Manhattan south of 60th Street have steadily fallen: from 9.1 miles per hour (mph) in 2010 to 7 mph in 2018, a decline of 23%.

Traffic congestion adversely affects the economy and quality of life in New York City and the metropolitan region. Low travel speeds and unreliable travel times increase auto commute times and erode worker productivity; reduce bus service quality and depress ridership; raise the cost of deliveries and the overall cost of business; increase vehicle emissions; and degrade the quality of life for residents, visitors, and workers. According to a 2018 analysis by the Partnership for New York City, a business group, congestion in the New York City region will cost business, commuters, and residents \$100 billion over the next five years (PFNYC, 2018).

In terms of air pollution, growing congestion threatens to undermine recent improvements in air quality in New York City and the region. High levels of fine particulate matter (PM_{2.5}), nitrogen dioxide, and nitric oxide—pollutants that exacerbate heart and respiratory disease—continue to be observed in areas of high traffic. The problem is particularly acute in the Manhattan CBD, which a New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene (DOHMH) air quality study found has among the highest concentrations of PM_{2.5} in the city. DOHMH estimates that PM_{2.5} contributes to more than 2,000 deaths and almost 6,000 emergency room visits and hospitalizations for cardiovascular and respiratory disease each year in the five boroughs.

One of the strategies to reduce the level of congestion experienced in the CBD is sustained investment in public transportation alternatives. More than 75 percent of trips into the Manhattan CBD are made by bus, subway, commuter rail or ferry. Due to the age and extent of the bus and subway system, service quality has declined markedly since 2010. Improving reliability and performance of the bus and subway system is essential to retaining existing riders, increasing ridership and reversing the growth of private car and for-hire vehicles trips, which are putting further stress on the street network. Due to congested conditions, local bus service speeds in Manhattan are, on average, 24% slower than citywide speeds. Reduction in traffic will result in faster more reliable bus service, which will disproportionately benefit low-income residents.

Reducing congestion in the Manhattan CBD is essential to continued economic growth and to improved regional air quality. In recognition of the scope of these challenges, the State of New York enacted legislation in April

Submitted 6/17/19

2019 creating the Central Business District Tolling Program (CBDTP). Under the program, TBTA, in coordination with the NYS and NYC DOTs, will charge vehicles that enter or remain within in the CBD. Pricing access to the CBD will reduce vehicle demand, relieving congestion and increasing the efficiency of the street network. Revenue raised by the program will provide sustained funding for public transportation, which as it becomes more reliable, will contribute to congestion relief. Please see Attachment C for the CBDTP legislation and Attachment D for a program history.

2.) Area Description:

Vehicles would be charged a toll to enter or remain within the Manhattan CBD, defined in the legislation as Manhattan south of and inclusive of sixtieth street, exclusive of the FDR Drive, New York State Route 9A (known as the West Side Highway or West St.), the Battery Park Underpass, and any surface roadway portion of the Hugh L. Carey Tunnel connecting to West Street. Please see Attachment E for a map of the CBD.

3.) Previous Studies/Current Studies

e.g.(Existing HOV, Managed Lanes/Feasibility, Environmental Impact Statement Project Studies)

In July 2007, the State of New York created the New York City Traffic Congestion Mitigation Commission to consider proposals to reduce congestion in New York City, including a plan put forward by then Mayor Michael Bloomberg to implement congestion pricing in Manhattan. The Commission analyzed and reviewed a number of different strategies for reducing congestion and ultimately recommended a modified version of the Bloomberg congestion pricing plan in January 2008. The proposal was not acted upon by the New York State Legislature.

<https://www.dot.ny.gov/programs/repository/TCMC-Final-Report.pdf>

In October 2017, New York Governor Andrew M. Cuomo created the Fix NYC Panel, bringing together community representatives, government officials, and business leaders from across the region. The panel was tasked with developing recommendations to address the severe traffic congestion problems in Manhattan's CBD and identify sources of revenue to fix the subway system. The panel examined what congestion pricing could look like for the Manhattan CBD; the panel's January 2018 final report can be found here:

<https://www.hntb.com/HNTB/media/HNTBMediaLibrary/Home/Fix-NYC-Panel-Report.pdf>

Building on the work of the Fix NYC Panel, the 2018 New York State Enacted Budget created the Metropolitan Transportation Sustainability Advisory Workgroup. The workgroup examined actions that state and local governments could take to deal with the multiple challenges confronting the transportation system in the New York City region. The panel recommended that congestion pricing be adopted to reduce congestion and generate new revenue to modernize the MTA; the workgroup's December 2018 final report can be found here:

<https://pfny.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/12/2018-12-Metropolitan-Transportation-Sustainability-Advisory-Workgroup-Report.pdf>

4.) Project Goals:

The goals of the CBD Tolling Program are to:

(1) Reduce traffic congestion

- Key metrics: traffic volumes, speeds, and travel time reliability within the Manhattan CBD and on key routes connecting to the CBD.

(2) Improve air quality

- Key metrics: air quality measurements at locations within and around the Manhattan CBD, with a focus on environmental justice communities.

(3) Create a sustainable funding source to repair and revitalize the MTA transit system

- Key metric: generate revenues, net of VPPP operating costs, to support \$15 billion in bonds for MTA capital transit repair and revitalization projects.

(4) Increase transit ridership

- Key metrics: bus, subway, and commuter rail ridership; modal shift from auto, particularly single occupant vehicles, to transit; quality of transit services.

Submitted 6/17/19

(5) Improve travel options for low-income residents

- Key metrics: quality of transit services available to low-income residents; bus speeds and travel time reliability.

5.) Project Concept:

Vehicles entering the Manhattan CBD would be charged a toll, which would be collected via a cashless tolling system. The legislation leaves open the possibility that trips that occur entirely within the zone could also be charged a toll. It is envisioned that motorists could pay by app, online, by phone, by mail, or through a pre-paid account-based system. The revenues generated by the program would be used to construct, operate and maintain the CBD toll collection program and modernize the MTA transit system, with the goal of attracting new riders and further reducing vehicle demand for scarce road capacity in and connecting to the Manhattan CBD.

E) Which type of facility is proposed to be tolled or studied?☐ Interstate☐ Non-Interstate☐ Project contains both types of facilities☒ Project is not specific to any type of facility

As explained above, vehicles would be charged to enter or remain within a specific area. This area does not include an interstate facility.

F) Does the toll project involve ANY construction?☐ No☒ Yes (if so, please mark all that apply)☐ Not applicable☐ New construction☐ Expansion☐ Rehabilitation ☐ Reconstruction☐ HOV to HOT Conversion☒ Other not listed.

Please briefly elaborate:

Limited construction to install tolling infrastructure and supporting utilities will be required. The tolling equipment will, to the extent practicable, be mounted on existing infrastructure. Where this is not practicable, new infrastructure or replacement infrastructure will be installed, likely in the form of street light poles, sign gantries or similar structures that are already in use throughout the city. Power and communications will need to be supplied to these locations if not already present. There may be some minor modification of street geometry to enhance or maintain safe pedestrian, bicycle and vehicle movements. The TBTA and NYC DOT have entered into a memorandum of understanding (MOU) for coordinating the planning, design, installation, construction and maintenance of the CBD tolling infrastructure. Please see Attachment F for a copy of the MOU.

G) Does an HOV lane(s) currently exist on the facility?☐ No☐ Yes☒ Not applicable**H) What is the timetable to enact the tolling or pricing project or study?**

New York State desires to implement the tolling program in early 2021. A preliminary schedule is presented in Attachment G.

Submitted 6/17/19

I) Are there expressions of support from public officials or the public? Have any public meetings been held? If no public meetings or expressions of support are available, please indicate the agency's plans for ensuring adequate public involvement and seeking public support for the toll project or study.

Legislation approved by the New York State Senate and Assembly and signed by Governor Andrew M. Cuomo went into effect in April 2019. The CBD Tolling Program was proposed by the Governor Cuomo and supported by the Assembly Speaker Carl Heastie, Senate Majority Leader Andrea Stewart-Cousins, New York City Mayor Bill de Blasio and a majority of the New York State Assembly and Senate. In addition, the FixOurTransit coalition, a group representing over 100 business, labor, environmental, transportation and justice organizations, supported the CBD Tolling Program. Please see Attachment H for a list of coalition members and supportive stakeholder statements.

TBTA with NYC DOT will develop a robust public engagement process as the program moves forward. Working with elected officials, community boards, interest groups in town hall and other settings, the agencies will solicit feedback on all phases of the program. Additionally, the federal environmental review process will provide opportunities for public involvement.

J) Where known (and if applicable), what is plan for implementing tolls or prices and the strategies to vary toll rates or prices (i.e., the formulae for variable pricing)?

The authorizing legislation for the program put forth a general framework that will be refined over the next 18 months. The law mandates that passenger vehicles will be charged once daily to enter or remain in the zone, the toll will be variable, and emergency vehicles and vehicles transporting disabled persons will be exempt from the toll. Residents of the CBD with an adjusted gross income of under \$60,000 will be eligible for a state tax credit for any tolls paid. A new six-member board, called the Traffic Mobility Review Board (TMRB), will recommend specific toll rates and policies, and will consider variable toll options, additional exemptions, and credits for tolls paid on other facilities for adoption by the TBTA Board.

The authorizing legislation also requires TBTA and NYC DOT to conduct a traffic study that the TMRB will use to inform its recommendations. The traffic study will examine a range of toll rates, variable tolling structures, exemptions, and toll credits. The study will be separate from, but consistent with, the traffic analysis required for the federal environmental review for the program (which will also assess other areas of impact).

Preliminary work is underway for the traffic study and the environmental review. Both efforts will rely upon the most advanced modeling and data analysis tools available, including the Best Practice Model (BPM), the regional transportation model developed by New York Metropolitan Transportation Council (the regional metropolitan planning organization).

In order to develop a range of variable tolling structures, rates and policy scenarios for the TMRB's consideration, the traffic study will examine:

- Effects on general traffic volumes, speeds and travel time reliability within and outside the Manhattan CBD
- Effects on driver behavior, including route, mode and time of travel
- Effects on bus speeds and travel time reliability within and outside the Manhattan CBD
- Effects on transit ridership within and to/from the Manhattan CBD
- Effects on vehicle emissions and air quality within and outside the Manhattan CBD
- Effects on low-income drivers to the Manhattan CBD
- Revenue generation
- Other relevant factors

The TMRB will make its recommendations to the TBTA Board between November 15 and December 31, 2020, per the authorizing statute. Informed by the TMRB recommendations, the TBTA Board will follow the

Submitted 6/17/19

prescribed statutory process for determining the toll structure, which includes a public hearing and a vote on the rates. The environmental review, which is expected to be complete before the TMRB makes its recommendations, will include traffic analysis based on a range of potential rates and variable tolling structures.

Beginning one year after the CBD tolling program is implemented and every two years thereafter for the life of the program, TBTA, in consultation with the NYC DOT, will undertake a comprehensive evaluation of the effects of the program and produce an evaluation report that looks at congestion, air quality, transit ridership and other factors. In addition, NYC DOT will undertake a study of effects of the program on parking activity and demand in and around of the Manhattan CBD, which is due 18 months after the system begins operation.

K) What is the reason(s) of the toll project or study? Please mark all that apply.

☐ Financing construction

☒ Reducing congestion

☒ Improving air quality

☒ Other not listed.

ADDRESS ALL AREAS

Please briefly elaborate:

Reducing Congestion

As detailed in Section D, worsening congestion in and around the Manhattan CBD is increasing commute times, degrading bus service, contributing to vehicle emissions, eroding quality of life, and raising the cost of business. By reducing congestion, the CBD tolling program would reverse these trends by improving the efficiency of the transportation network, including improving bus speeds, and supporting the continued economic growth of the city and region.

Improving Air Quality

As detailed in Section D, emissions from the transportation sector are a major contributor to air pollution in New York City and the region, particularly in the congested Manhattan CBD. These emissions exacerbate cardiovascular and respiratory illness and are a public health concern. By reducing traffic volumes and congestion and associated emissions, the CBD tolling program would improve air quality and overall public health.

Create a Sustainable Capital Funding Source for Transit

The MTA subway system is over one hundred years old and needs to be fundamentally modernized to serve the needs of New York City and the region. Improvements are also needed in the MTA's bus and commuter rail systems. By creating a new sustainable revenue source, the CBD tolling program would enable the MTA to invest in improving its transportation network, which in turn, would support the program's goals of increasing transit ridership and improving transit services for low-income residents.

Increasing Transit Ridership

As detailed in Section D, bus and subway service quality in New York City has fallen. As a result, some transit riders have switched to private cars or for-hire vehicle services, putting added strain on the street network. By funding the modernization of the transit network, the CBD tolling program would improve transit services and attract commuters back to the system, helping to further ease demand on surface streets and thus reduce congestion in the CBD.

Improving Transit Services for Low-Income Residents

Ninety-eight percent of low-income workers with jobs in the Manhattan CBD do not commute by private vehicle (Community Service Society, 2017). Dedicating program revenues to transit improvements will

Submitted 6/17/19

disproportionately benefit low-income New Yorkers, who overwhelmingly rely on transit to access employment, education, and essential services. By enabling investments in transit, the CBD tolling program would improve transit options for low-income New Yorkers.

L) Please provide a description of the public and/or private agency that will be responsible for operation, maintenance, and/or enforcement for the toll project or study?

1) **NYSDOT** coordinates and develops comprehensive transportation policy for New York State; coordinates and assists in the development and operation of transportation facilities and services for highways, railroads, mass transit systems, ports, waterways and aviation facilities; and, formulates and keeps current a long-range, comprehensive statewide master plan for the balanced development of public and private commuter and general transportation facilities.

2) **TBTA** is authorized by the program legislation to establish, plan, design, construct, install, operate and maintain the Central Business District Tolling Program in consultation with NYC DOT.

TBTA is among the largest toll agencies in the world. In 2018 TBTA served more than 322 million customers and collected nearly \$2.0 billion in toll revenue on its seven bridges and two tunnels within New York City: the Bronx-Whitestone, Cross Bay Veterans Memorial, Marine Parkway-Gil Hodges Memorial, Throgs Neck, Robert F. Kennedy and Verrazzano-Narrows Bridges and the Hugh L. Carey and Queens-Midtown Tunnels. The Legislature created TBTA's initial predecessor, the Triborough Bridge Authority, in 1933 to build the Triborough Bridge. TBTA is a New York State public benefit corporation, currently governed by Article 3, Title 3 of the New York Public Authorities Law, §550 *et seq.*

TBTA was designed to generate surplus toll revenue, which has been used to support the MTA's integrated transportation network since TBTA became an MTA affiliate in 1968. In 2018, TBTA provided nearly \$1.1 billion in total support for transit. TBTA is also dedicated to maintaining its seven bridges and two tunnels in a state of good repair and to providing safe and efficient travel across its facilities. TBTA's 2015-2019 Capital Program, which totals nearly \$3 billion, gives high priority to key rehabilitation projects. In 2017 TBTA enhanced the customer experience by converting all of its facilities to open road, Cashless Tolling.

3) **NYC DOT**, which owns and operates the roadway network within and outside of the CBD charging zone, will support and assist TBTA. NYC DOT's mission is to provide for the safe, efficient, and environmentally responsible movement of people and goods in the City of New York and to maintain and enhance the transportation infrastructure crucial to the economic vitality and quality of life of our primary customers, city residents. Over 5,000 employees of NYC DOT oversee one of the most complex urban transportation networks in the world. NYC DOT's staff manage an annual operating budget of \$900 million and a five-year \$10.1 billion capital program, along with 6,000 miles of streets and highways, 12,000 miles of sidewalk, and 794 bridges and tunnels, including the iconic East River bridges. NYC DOT's staff also installs and maintains over one million street signs, 12,700 signalized intersections, over 315,000 street lights, and over 200 million linear feet of markings.

M) Please provide a description of how, if at all, any private entities are involved in the up-front costs, or will share in project responsibilities, debt retirement, or revenues?

No private entities are involved.

Submitted 6/17/19

N) Please provide any additional information you feel is necessary.

Below is further information on New York's Best Practice Model (BPM), which will be used for both the environmental review and the traffic study for the TMRB:

The applicants will use the New York Metropolitan Transportation Council's (NYMTC) Best Practice Model (BPM) to assess the potential impact of the tolling program on travel patterns throughout the city and region. The BPM, developed by the New York City metropolitan area's metropolitan planning organization (MPO), is an activity-based transportation model that incorporates transportation behavior and relationships with an extensive set of data that includes a major travel survey of households in the region, land-use inventories, socioeconomic data, traffic and transit counts, and travel times. The applicants will use a base year 2017 BPM calibrated to the toll program, which includes a taxi trip table updated to include for hire vehicles (FHV) trips in New York City in addition to yellow and green taxi trips. The BPM will be used to model several different pricing scenarios and will produce the following metrics: (1) comparison of river crossing volumes by time period (AM, MD, PM, NT, 24 hours), (2) district level vehicle-miles travelled and vehicle hours travelled measures (AM, MD, PM, NT, 24 hours), and district-to-district flow and mode shares (auto, transit, and FHV) for 2021 and 2040 (or another future year). The analysis will include regional routes into Manhattan including trans-Hudson crossings. Districts can be defined at the county and traffic analysis zone level of analysis. New York City districts will include all five boroughs and four to five sub-regions within the Manhattan CBD that will be defined at the start of the program.